# Notes

## CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION

1. Tombois often called themselves lesbi during my fieldwork; see also Prawirakusumah and Ramadhan (1988:19–20).

2. Lesbi sometimes refers to masculine and feminine women and sometimes only to feminine women. Lesbian has been part of the Indonesian language since at least the early 1980s. The widespread preference for lesbi over lesbian is probably because in the Indonesian language -an is a common suffix that typically derives nouns from verbs, such as makanan "food" from makan "eat" (Sneddon 1996:30–31). Lesbian thus feels like a compounded term, particularly because it is three syllables long, rather than Indonesian’s typical two-syllable root word structure.

3. Here, as throughout this book, I do not italicize "gay" when referring to non-Indonesians.

4. The pioneering works by anthropologists on "Indonesia" emphasize mass media (Heider 1991) or history (Siegel 1997) rather than ethnography.

5. I owe this phrase to Stephan Helmreich.

6. See, for instance, Joseph Massad’s (2002) essay concerning what he terms the "Gay International" in the Arab world. While Massad’s attention to unequal global power relations and the problematic nature of human rights discourse is salutary, his implicit theory of globalization, participation in the stereotype that homosexuals are upper class (362, 372–373), and assumption that the apparent "movement" of "gay" is always brute mechanical transfer (383) all follow the McGay trope that "gay" is irredeemably Western (382). Given the resonance between "Gay International" and "Communist International," the former term could be seen to suggest a global gay menace by participating in the McCarthyist stereotype that homosexuals recruit.

7. Concerns of similitude and difference are not limited to postcolonial and queer theory; they have been one of the animating concerns of anthropology (from the "psychic unity of mankind" to "cultural relativism") and also of Southeast Asian studies, under the figure of "continuity and change" (Benda 1972; Smail 1961).

8. See also, inter alia, Anagnost (1997); Bowen (1997); S. Brenner (1998); Cohen (1995, 1998); Ivy (1995); Kahn (1993); Mills (1995); Ram and Jolly (1998); Stivens (1998); Tanabe and Keyes (2002); Tsing (1993).

9. The irony is that postmodernism is associated not with elitism but with effacing the distinction between high and low culture (compare "modernist" Mondrian to "postmodernist" Warhol, or "modernist" Schönberg to "postmodernist" Glass).

## CHAPTER TWO HISTORICAL TEMPTATIONS

1. Homosexuality appears in the Dutch colonial penal code (Wetboek van Strafecht), Article 292 (which remains Article 292 in the Indonesian penal code), but is oriented toward sexual assault and sex below the age of consent. This law was apparently never enforced before the late 1930s. Dutch civil law was derived from the Napoleonic Code, which gave little emphasis to homosexuality. In comparison, British common law was significantly more disapproving of homosexuality, still visible in the harsher legal regimes of former British colonies like Malaysia and Singapore. The lack of attention to homosexuality in the Dutch East Indies is particularly surprising given the relatively large number of military prosecutions for homosexual behavior in nineteenth-century Holland itself; one discharged navy officer claimed to have had sex with forty-one Indonesians during a two-and-a-half-year stint in the colony (Hekma 1991:283).

2. Halilintar Lathief, comments at the National Conference on Male Sexual Health, Puncak, Indonesia, September 6, 2004.

3. Some bissus dress androgynously only for ritual purposes and otherwise appear as normal men, complete with wife and children: "[E]ven a ‘normal’ married man seems to be capable of being a bissu as long as he merely conducts himself half as man and half as woman during the ritual" (Chabot 1996[1950]:194). See also Hamonic (1975:125); Lathief (2004:58); Mattulada (1974).

4. See Wilson (1999); Tiras no. 16, thn 1, 18 May 1995, special insert p. H.

5. They were also a favorite subject of colonial ethnographers; see, e.g., the summary provided in Karsch-Haack (1911:188–215).

6. This narrative is apparently taken in full from an article published in the newspaper Persamaan on Monday, February 13, 1939. It is summarized in Budiman (1979:111–113). Amen Budiman was a historian based in Semarang (Central Java) who wrote on Indonesian homosexuality and transgenderism (Budiman 1979, 1982). Budiman claimed to have discovered this narrative in Pimpinan Islam (1940), Mohammad ‘Ali Alhamidy, pp. 60–61, publisher unknown, but I have been unable to locate this text. The version here is taken from Alhamidy (1951:47–48).

7. Ulrich Kratz, personal communication, October 5, 2004.

8. See Kratz (1978). My analysis is based on Budiman’s edited and Indonesianized version of the narrative (the original was in a mixture of Javanese and Indonesian), but I am here interested in the broad outlines of Sucipto’s life, not a close linguistic analysis. I will use Budiman’s modernized spelling of "Sucipto’s" name.

9. A city in Java.

10. By 1940 enough arrests had taken place that a sample of one hundred arrested men could be used for a study on homosexual prostitution and disease (Simons 1940).

11. See Gouda (1995: chaps. 4 and 5).

12. Sucipto’s biography was discovered in Overbecks’s papers. Ulrich Kratz, personal communication, October 5, 2004.

## CHAPTER THREE DUBBING CULTURE

1. Oxford English Dictionary, second ed., vol. 4.

2. This phrase references Oetomo (1997).

3. Homosexuality was removed as a psychological disorder in January 1982 in Indonesia.

4. "Aku Menemukan Kepribadianku Sebagai Seorang Homosex," Anda, no. 44 (July 1980):26, 30.

5. The inside title was: "This is a real shock—the first time in Indonesia: Girl [cewek] married with a girl. The marriage ceremony attended by the parents and 120 guests."

6. Reported in Gaya Hidup Ceria, no. 1 (8/82). The Western magazine in question was not named.

7. Report on Lesbians in Indonesia, p. 2.

8. See Heider (1991) and Sen (1994) for detailed historical and contemporary accounts of Indonesian cinema (both works were published before the rise of private television in Indonesia). Heider notes that between 1945 and 1990 the number of films produced yearly in Indonesia ranged from zero (in 1946 and 1947, for instance) to over one hundred in 1977 and 1989 (19).

9. Popular (May 1997):33. Despite an illustrious history of film production and a number of directors producing serious films (Heider 1991; Sen 1994) "the 1980s saw the near-collapse of the domestic film industry" (Hefner 1997:94) due to competition from Hollywood and other exporters, coupled with the New Order’s stifling censorship policies. During the 1990s domestic production was dominated by soft-porn films targeting lower-class audiences. For example, of the twenty-seven films produced in Indonesia in 1996 that received nationwide distribution, only one had a theme other than sex (Popular [May 1997]).

10. E.g. Nusa, March 6, 1998.

11. Popular (March 1996):53.

12. Nusa, March 18, 1998.

13. Bali Post, March 1, 1998, p. 8.

14. On March 15, 1998, the Balinese newspaper Nusa ran a two-page exposé on lesbi life composed of ten articles. While much of the coverage was sensationalistic, several articles called for greater social acceptance of lesbi women.

15. For instance, in 1997 Popular magazine sent a reporter to cover the Gay/Lesbian Mardi Gras in Sydney; he related tales of hanging out in gay bars and meeting a lesbian couple as well as the lesbian executive director of the event (April 1997:44, 48–50). International events like the Gay Games are covered, as are same-sex rights and domestic partner legislation in Europe, the United States, and South Africa. See, e.g., "Homoseks Marriage: An Example of Moral Pluralism" [Perkawinan Homoseks: Contoh Pluralisme Moral], Kompas, June 12, 1996. See chapter 9.

16. Imported programs come from around the world, with many favorites from India, Latin America, and Japan. To my knowledge, however, gay and lesbi seem to be formed exclusively with reference to programs originally in English and originating above all from the United States, as these examples indicate.

17. For instance, many print media carried articles on Doug Savant, the actor playing the gay character Matt Fielding in Melrose Place (e.g., Bintang, May 28, 1997).

18. Examples of significant interviews with Oetomo appear in Jakarta Jakarta, May 22–28, 1993; Popular (July 1995); and Matra (August 1999).

19. "Tayangan yang Menjadi Buah Bibir," Talk Show.

20. Kompas, June 25, 1997. This comes from a pojok or "corner column": "the essence of the pojok is biting, anonymous comment on the latest news…. The art of pojok writing is one of allusion, innuendo, sarcasm, and mock surprise" (Anderson 1990:142–143).

21. In the wake of these protests, RCTI and SCTV "cleaned up" their shows, which in RCTI’s case included firing Debra Yatim in favor of a less controversial moderator.

22. Nusa, November 28, 1997.

23. Since about 2003 there have appeared some soft-porn taboids such as X-Pos that speak openly about homosexuality (and all forms of nonmarital heterosexuality), using images of Western bodies found on the Internet. Around this time some male sex workers also began advertising their services (barely concealed as "massage") in tabloids like Memorandum. Fundamentalist Islamic groups have protested such publications on occasion; an event held by X-Pos in Central Java in 2004 was raided by an Islamic group that made threats and burned all the copies of X-Pos they found but did not injure anyone. Should such more explicit mass media images and texts persist and expand, they will undoubtedly shape how gay and lesbi Indonesians come to their sexual subjectivities.

24. See, inter alia, Anderson (1983), J. Errington (1998), Maier (1993), Siegel (1997), Sneddon (2003).

25. The five private stations at the time were RCTI, SCTV, TPI, Anteve, and Indosiar. The number is increasing. Estimates of the proportion of shows originating outside of Indonesia range from two-thirds (Wahyuni 2000:116) from the United States to 50 percent from the United States and Europe combined (Groves 1996:42).

26. Republika (Jakarta), May 2, 1996. RCTI was not only the first private television station to go national (in 1995), but the first to begin broadcasting, in 1989. Even the government television station TVRI was introduced only in the late 1970s (Lindsay 1997:117, 113).

27. As does negotiate; these subjectivities are not negotiated in the sense that Maira (1999) speaks of an "identity dub" among South Asian Americans in the New York club scene.

28. Here I use articulation in its English sense. The term originally entered social theory through Marx, but Gliederung has only the first of the two meanings noted above. The root word, Gleid, means "limb" or "joint" but can also mean "penis" (ma¨nnliches Glied). Surely there is great potential in a psychoanalytic treatment that links the moment of speech to erection.

29. Lydia Liu notes that in studying how "a word, category, or discourse ‘travels’ from one language to another," we must "account for the vehicle of translation" and address "the condition of translation" itself (1995:20–21, 26), a concern

with a long history in anthropology as well (Asad 1986; Streck and Maranha˜o 2003).

## CHAPTER FOUR ISLANDS OF DESIRE

1. For instance, in 1951 Alhamidy spoke of sex between women as "usually done suka sama suka, not by force" (1951:48).

2. With regard to gay men in Jakarta, Howard notes they "hold a distinctive conception of homosexuality as a social product rather than as a feature of an internal, biological[ly] based sexual orientation" (1996:109).

3. In Howard’s primary sample of fifty-one gay men in Jakarta, "22 … described becoming aware of their gay identities" after having been seduced (Howard 1996:133).

4. See S. Wieringa (1999a:218). This is also the driving force in Menguak Duniaku, where at one point three women vie for Hen and even initiate sexual contact (Prawirakusumah and Ramadhan 1988:33, see also 36, 118–119, 121). Even as one of these women ends her relationship, she speaks of her desire and Hen’s tomboi desire as the same (159).

5. This appears to be the case even in the 1930s’ southern Sumatra incident described in chapter 3.

6. The identity/behavior binarism originated in nineteenth-century notions of acquired (situational, circumstantial) versus innate (congenital) homosexuality (see Bleys 1995).

7. Historically, only in cases of physical or mental disability, or of high-status women unable to find suitable husbands, is there any evidence of an honorable way to avoid marriage (Florida 1996; S. Errington 1989).

8. For instance, Barth (1993), Jones (1994), Hoskins (1998), Niehof (2003).

9. "Very often the first conflicts and disappointments [between parents and children who had been given a ‘modern’ education] centered around the choice of a wife…. In such communities marriage did not merely represent the union of boy and girl, but a further extension of all kinds of family relationships…. It is thus not altogether surprising that in the literature of the young Indonesian generation, which began to appear in this atmosphere of conflict between modern and traditional Indonesian culture, the conflict, in all its aspects, was a major theme" (Alisjahbana 1966:30–31; see also Hatley and Blackburn 2000).

10. See also Rodgers (1995:3). This link between postcolonial self and nation is not unique to Indonesia: frequently in postcolonial literature "an individual’s story represents that of an entire collectivity by narrating a return to the roots of identity (both individual and collective) and the birth of political consciousness" (Hayes 2000:13).

11. GAYa Nusantara 102 (2003):5.

12. Heteronormativity, of course, has been a key element of nationalist discourse since its beginnings (Eder, Hall, and Hekma 1999; Mosse 1985) and has played a role in debates over definitions of proper citizenship in Euro-America (Beriss 1996, Berlant 1997; Borneman 1992; Duggan and Hunter 1995; Parker

et al. 1992; Warner 1999). In contemporary postcolonial societies, debates over national belonging can take forms that incorporate, in various ways, these European origins of heteronormative nationalist ideology (Garcia 1996; Heng and Devan 1995; Jackson 1997, 1999; Lancaster 1995; Lumsden 1996; Manalansan 2003; Mankekar 1999; McLelland 2000; D. Murray 1996, Parker 1999; Sang 2003; Schein 1996).

13. In one sample, 89% of sixty-two unmarried core interlocutors planned on marrying women.

14. Though I knew of no cases personally, interlocutors in more than one field site spoke of cases where a tomboi and waria married each other, with the tomboi wife becoming pregnant in some instances.

15. "Javanese women are generally more deeply committed than men to the social and economic welfare of the family and therefore rarely overstep the marital boundaries. They are tolerant of their husbands’ irregularities because men are considered to be by nature irresponsible. Their sexual promiscuity is called being nakal (naughty), which is the same term applied to disobedient or unruly children, there being no connotation of adult misdemeanor; and they are expected to be nakal both during their bachelorhood and after marriage. When a woman is young, her injured pride makes her angry upon discovery of her husband’s infidelity, but, as she grows older and there are children, she is more concerned with the loss of money that might otherwise be spent in the family’s interests" (H. Geertz 1961:131). See also Brenner (1998:149–157) and Suryakusuma (1996).

## CHAPTER FIVE GEOGRAPHIES OF BELONGING

1. Because most gay and lesbi Indonesians come to their sexual subjectivities with little face-to-face interaction, it is possible to be gay or lesbi without contact with the gay or lesbi worlds, leading a celibate life or having sex with normal men or women. Letters to newspapers identifying the writer as a gay or lesbi person who has never met another indicate that such Indonesians exist. I have no way of estimating how many gay and lesbi Indonesians live separate from the gay and lesbi worlds.

2. I draw from two interlinked traditions in my analysis of these ethnographic materials. The first is the work of feminist and queer geographers who have emphasized how gender and sexuality are produced through spatial relationships (Bell and Valentine 1995; Ingram, Bouthillette, and Retter 1997; Massey 1994). Second, I draw on the work of thinkers who examine how the "practices of everyday life" shape how space is "directly lived through its associated images and symbols" (Lefebvre 1991:39; also Bourdieu 1977; N. Brenner 1998, 1999, 2000).

3. Gay men and lesbi women began using the Internet in significant numbers around 1995, but the first online editions of magazines, gay chat groups, and other computer-based activities did not begin until mid-1998. The effect of the Internet on gay and lesbi subjectivities is still uncertain but sure to increase. Internet use adds new class and educational barriers to the gay and lesbi worlds,

since one must know how to use a computer and be able to access it with some degree of privacy.

4. Tunjungan Plaza is to my knowledge the only mall in Indonesia that has, for certain periods of time, had stores that sold condoms and sex toys (Kroeger 2000:121).

5. Sabang is in Indonesia’s extreme northwestern corner (in the province of Aceh) while Merauke is in the extreme southeastern corner (in the province of Papua [formerly Irian Jaya]). Ironically, both of these provinces currently have strong separatist movements.

6. "Several [gay Indonesians in Jakarta] told me of their ‘discovery’ of the idea of homosexuality after reading an article on homosexuality in the women’s magazine Sarinah in 1981" (Howard 1996:254).

## CHAPTER SIX PRACTICES OF SELF, TESTS OF FAITH

1. The notion of "style" has appeared in other contexts with regard to the conjuncture of nonnormative genders and sexualities; for instance, Tonga (Besnier 2002) and the Philippines (Johnson 1997). For further discussion of citizenship as performative, see, e.g., Kuipers (2003).

2. Lesbi women refer to these masculine and feminine genderings with a variety of terms. A few know the English terms "butch" and "femme," but more often they employ paired sets of terms from standard Indonesian vocabulary: masculin versus feminin, kelakian (maleness) versus kewanitaan (femaleness), cowok (boy) versus cewek (girl; see Blackwood 1999), gaya laki-laki (male style) versus gaya perempuan (female style), and the Javanese terms sentul (masculine) versus kantil (feminine). In Makassar and other parts of Indonesia, feminine lesbi women can be termed lines; this is a gay language transformation of lesbi that also sometimes refers to lesbi women in general.

3. For instance, in a television commercial shown nationally in 2000, a mother comments on her favorite brand of laundry detergent as her young daughter is shown walking home from school, wearing a school uniform and also a Muslim headscarf. As the little girl runs home, getting dirt and chocolate ice cream on her headscarf, the mother opines "my girl is a real tomboi."

4. The only case to my knowledge of an ethnolocalized term for tomboi is Bugis calalai’, but in urban southern Sulawesi at least this term does not appear to be in common use. Most of my tomboi interlocutors there did not know of this term and used "hunter" and/or "tomboi" to describe themselves.

5. Two ngondhek men in a sexual relationship may be jokingly referred to as lesbi by other gay men, even though many gay men know that lesbi relationships are usually between tombois and ceweks.

6. Ngondhek (sometimes spelled ngondek) appears to be the best-known term (see Howard 1996:301). There are a range of other terms for male effeminacy with varying degrees of national circulation, including mégol (mostly in South Sulawesi), kewanitaan (an abstract noun derived from wanita, "woman"), kriting (curly), lémbéng (mostly in Java), and feminin.

7. See Butler (1993); Foucault (1978); Halperin (1995); Sedgwick (1991).

8. Published in GAYa Nusantara 51 (August 1997).

## CHAPTER SEVEN THE POSTCOLONIAL STATE AND GAY AND LESBI SUBJECTIVITIES

1. I develop my theory of hegemony in dialogue with Birmingham School theorists like Stuart Hall despite the fact that some anthropologists believe that such theorists (and many anthropologists) have strayed too far from Gramsci’s understanding of hegemony (Crehan 2002; Kurtz 1996).

2. This recalls Bourdieu’s concept of habitus: "Because the subjective necessity and self-evidence of the commonsense world are validated by the objective consensus on the sense of the world, what is essential goes without saying because it comes without saying" (Bourdieu 1977:167, emphasis in original).

3. "Spatial metaphors, both implicit and explicit, form a pervasive mode of organizing consciousness in [Island Southeast Asia]" (S. Errington 1989:13).

4. Proyek Penelitian Keagamaan (1984:5).

5. The usual formula, the Indonesians argued, would result in over ten thousand miles of border due to the number of islands within Indonesia. See Kusumaatmadja (1982); Proyek Penelitian Keagamaan (1984:5). This declaration that Indonesia was an archipelagic state is known as the "Djuanda Declaration" after the name of the prime minister at the time (Proyek Penelitian Keagamaan [1984:5]).

6. Proyek Penelitian Keagamaan (1984:8).

7. Centre for Strategic and International Studies (1991:17–18).

8. There is an extensive literature on the relationship between the postcolonial state and marriage in Indonesia, as well as the sexism of the family principle. See, for instance, Blackburn and Bessell (1997); Hatley (1997); Sears (1996); Sen (1998); Suryakusuma (1996); Tiwon (1996).

9. Tempo no. 36, thn. 17, November 7, 1987:105.

10. GAYa Nusantara 83:28–29 (2001).

11. GAYa Nusantara 83:29 (2001).

## CHAPTER EIGHT THE GAY ARCHIPELAGO

1. Some key works in this literature I have not yet cited include Donham (1998), Elliston (1999), Sinnott (2004), B. Tan (1999), M. Tan (1995).

2. The first national congress (kongres nasional) for the nationalist movement was also held in Yogyakarta, in 1908, the first "to include all levels of society" regardless of ethnicity or religion (K. Dewantara 1950:10).

3. In this history of activism, the figure of Dédé Oetomo looms paramount. This raises fascinating questions about the relationship between individuals and social formations, a difficult topic for anthropology, with its focus on the transindividual. Oetomo’s activist orientation reflects his association with gay and lesbian

organizations at Cornell in the United States while a doctoral student. He has also cultivated connections with gay and lesbian activists worldwide since attending the International Gay Association Conference in Wina, Austria, in July 1983, linkages further strengthened by HIV/AIDS work. Oetomo’s decades of activism, fluency in English, and international connections make him not only one of best-known gay men in Indonesia but one of the most atypical (Oetomo is also both openly atheist and ethnic Chinese).

4. GAYa LEStari (July 1994).

5. GAYa Nusantara 57:10 (1998); 58:8 (1998).

6. See, inter alia, Jackson (1997); Manalansan (1995); Morris (1997); Thongthiraj (1996).